Smith, Clytimas v. Walmart NOT COMPLETE YET

Plaintiff : Clytimas S	Smith	
D/A : Au	igust 15, 2013	
Exhibit Name	Exhibit Number	Admitted?
SDT		
Letter from DA		
CME Report		
Supplemental Report		
Supplemental Report		
Entire medical file		
Deposition List		
Trial List		
Correspondence to/from DA		
Invoices		
Rate Sheet		

DEFENSE TEAM

- 1. Part of the Defense team
- 2. Were you retained by the defense in this case to provide testimony?
- 3. What were you asked to do in this case?
- 4. Tina Smith is not your patient
- 5. You did not treat Tina Smith
- 6. You were not paid by the Defense to give Tina recommendations to alleviate her pain

- 7. Defense paid you to do one physical evaluation of Tina, review medical records and diagnostic studies and write a report?
- 8. Are all of your opinions contained within the reports your office provided to my office during the records custodian deposition?
- 9. Do you have any opinions that are not contained in those three reports?

QUALIFICATIONS/TREATING PATIENTS

- 10. Have you gotten any new certifications in the last 5 years?
- 11. Has what you do in your medical practice changed in the last five years?
- 12. When a patient comes to your office with a spine injury, how do you conduct the exam?
- 13. How long do you spend talking to a patient?
- 14. How long does the physical exam take?
- 15. What are all of the tests you perform on a patient in your office when they have a neck injury?

a. GO THROUGH EACH TEST

- i. Name of test
- ii. How it is performed
- iii. Why it is performed
- iv. Why is it important to do that test
- v. What does it mean if it is positive or negative/present or not present
- 16. When you use the pinwheel for neurological testing, are you expecting the person to feel a sharp sensation or dull sensation?
 - a. If dull, does that mean sensation is diminished?
- 17. If when you do the Babinski test, the toes point up, it is a positive exam?
- 18. What are all of the test you perform on a patient in your office when they have an injury to their lower back?

a. GO THROUGH EACH TEST

- i. Name of test
- ii. How it is performed
- iii. Why it is performed
- iv. Why is it important to do that test?
- v. What does it mean if it is positive or negative/present or not present

19. Have you ever operated on a patient who had a painful degenerative disc?

CMES/TESTIMONY PER YEAR

- 20. You've done 1000s of these types of CMEs during your career
- 21. Been doing them since 1991
- 22. What is the average cost of these evaluations?
 - a. \$1,950.00
 i. Does that include any review of medical records?
 1. How much does it include
- 23. How much do you charge for review of additional records?
 - a. \$1,000.00/HR
- 24. Do you still charge \$7,500.00 per day for trial testimony?
- 25. Over the past 12 years or so, you average 4-5 CMEs per week
- 26. You do about 200-230 of these evaluations per year
- 27. In fact, 20-30% of the work you do is being a CME
- 28. What percentage of expert work do you perform for Defendants vs. Plaintiffs
 - a. ROGS SAY 80% Defense
- 29. You give a lot of deposition and trial testimony, don't you?
- 30. In fact, You've testified over 100's of times for the defense over the course of your career
- 31. Since 2018, you've testified in deposition and at trial at least 10 times
- 32. And every single time it was for the Defense

Use Depo and Trial List:

2018 – 57 depos; 7 Trials 2019 - 44 depos; 3 Trials 2020 – 30 Depos; Total: 131 depos; 10 trials

- 33. You would agree that you have been paid millions of dollars by Defense entities to give CME opinions
- 34. How many times has the Defense counsel's firm had you do a CME on other Plaintiffs over the past 3 years?

NO ACCIDENT RECON AND BIOMECHANICAL TRAINING

- 35. You have no formal biomechanical training
- 36. You don't hold any certifications as a biomechanical expert
- 37. You have never been certified or declared an expert in biomechanical or biomedical expertise
- 38. You are not offering any biomechanical opinions
- 39. You are not offering any opinions as to the forces applied to Tina's body when she fell
- 40. You have no formal accident reconstruction training
- 41. You don't hold any certifications as an accident reconstructionist
- 42. You have never been certified or declared an expert in accident reconstruction
- 43. You are not offering any accident reconstruction opinions

NOT OFFERING AN OPINION ON LIABILITY

44. You are not offering an opinion on liability in this case

NOT OFFERING OPINIONS – COST OF MEDICAL TREATMENT

- 45. You are not planning to offer any opinions regarding the reasonableness of the cost of Tina's past medical treatment?
- 46. You're not planning to offer any opinions regarding the cost of any possible future medical treatment

NOT A KNEE SURGEON

47. You don't treat injuries to peoples knees?

- 48. You don't perform knee surgery
- 49. You are not offering any opinions regarding Tina's knee injuries and medical treatment

NOT A RADIOLOGIST

- 50. You are not a radiologist
- 51. You are not a neuroradiologist
- 52. You are not an interventional radiologist
- 53. You did not do a residency in radiology
- 54. You are not board certified in radiology

FUNCTION

- 55. Doctor, you have no idea about Tina's level or degree of daily activity before this fall, do you
- 56. Or AFTER the fall
- 57. Or Currently

<u>PAIN</u>

- 58. Pain is something that is real, isn't it?
- 59. As per what causes pain, what exacerbates pain, you would agree that the patient is in the best position to quantify the pain?
- 60. And based upon your review of the medical records you were provided, when you look at a diagnostic study, such as an MRI and x-ray, which is the studies you looked at in this case, are you able to see whether or not somebody is in pain by looking at those studies
- 61. Different people have different levels of pain threshold
- 62. People with injuries can have good days and bad days
 - a. Even after surgery
- 63. Pain can't be seen on an MRI or an X-ray, correct?

- 64. MRI doesn't measure pain
- 65. X-ray doesn't measure pain
- 66. MRI studies don't show chemical irritation of nerves
- 67. Chemical irritation of nerves can cause pain
- 68. Herniated discs don't have to be painful, right?
- 69. But, they can be made painful by trauma even if they weren't painful before, right?
- 70. You don't dispute that Tina has been having pain every day since his fall
- 71. Are you going to be offering any opinions whether or not Tina sustained pain or had pain from the fall?

SURGERIES IN GENERAL

- 72. Surgery is never a guaranteed cure all for pain
- 73. Radicular pain, loss of sensation, positive abnormal findings on MRI can make a person a surgical candidate?
- 74. After someone has a fusion in there spine, their spine is permanently changed
- 75. Surgeries typically leave scars
 - a. Either small puncture wounds
 - b. Sometimes long scars

MRI FINDINGS/DEGENERATIVE ISSUES - GENERAL

- 76. Medicine is not an exact science
- 77. People can have degeneration in their spine and not have any pain
- 78. People can have a herniated disc and not have any pain
- 79. Just because someone has degeneration in their spine, doesn't mean they need surgery

- 80. Just because someone has a herniated disco, doesn't mean they need surgery
- 81. Bone spurs found on an MRI oftentimes do not cause pain
- 82. Subsequent trauma can cause the areas where the bone spurs are to move, even slightly, which can cause pain
- 83. Bone spurs found on an MRI do not always require surgery
- 84. Its Very Very hard to provide a specific date of a finding on MRI
- 85. Just because someone has degenerative findings in the spine on MRI doesn't mean the herniations are always degenerative, correct?

ASYMPTOMATIC VS. SYMPTOMATIC/AGGRAVATION

- 86. People with a problem within their spine can often be asymptomatic, meaning they have no pain, right?
- 87. Trauma, like falling and hitting the ground, can cause a herniated in the lower back
- 88. Trauma, like falling and hitting the ground, can cause a herniated in the neck
- 89. Trauma, like falling and hitting the ground, can cause that pre-existing condition to become symptomatic, correct?
- 90. If someone has a preexisting condition, such as a herniation, they are more susceptible to injury?
- 91. People with a problem in their spine are easier to hurt due to a traumatic event like falling?
- 92. Trauma can aggravate a degenerative condition in the spine and cause them to become painful
- 93. Trauma can aggravate a degenerative condition in the spine and cause an increase in symptoms
- 94. Trauma can aggravate a degenerative condition, make it become symptomatic, and require surgery
- 95. Is that what happened here, that she had an exacerbation of pain as a result of trauma

DISCUSSIONS WITH DEFENSE COUNSEL

96. Discussion with Opposing Counsel

97. Dates/Times/Content

- a. 10/11/2019 Letter to Dr. Grabel requesting CME for 10/30/19 enclosing records
 i. Enclosed MANY records Use this during negative space
- b. 11/12/19 5:00PM Telephone Conference with Marc Greenberg (contained in the invoice)
 - i. How long
 - ii. Who was there
 - iii. What did you talk about
- c. 1/7/21 2:00PM Telephone Conference with Marc Greenberg (contained in the invoice)
 - i. How long
 - ii. Who was there
 - iii. What did you talk about

NEGATIVE SPACE

Name	Know them? Spoke to them?	Review Records?
FACT WITNESSES		
Tina Smith		
Benjamin Colon		
Alicea Elizer		
Felicia Hammond		
Horace Manyse		
Frances Jones		
Angie Moody		
Sophia Prince		
Willie Smith		
Lori Soberal		
Jennifer Stover		
Javorous Thompson		
Michael Schwede		
Myrtle Holligan		

MEDICAL	
PROVIDERS/MEDICAL	
RECORDS	
Dr. Mark Agresti	
Dr. Alan Bezner	
Dr. Jane bistline	
Dr. Shani Katz	
Dr. Justin Kearse	
Dr. Marion Klein	
Dr. Suneet Kukreja	
Dr. Gus Leotta	
Dr. Edwin Maldonado	
Dr. Charles Matuszak	
Dr. Frank McCormick	
Dr. Pascuale Montesano	
Dr. Brett Schlifka	
Dr. Reid Stone	
Dr. Po-Heng Tsai	
Dr. Richard Sarner	
Dr. Brian Young	
Dr. Chris Thompson	
Dr. Christopher White	
Good Samaritan Medical	
Center	
JFK Medical Center	
Palms west Hospital	
Wellington Regional Medical	
Center	
Central Palm Beach surgery	
Center	
Palm Beach Surgery Center	
Gardens urgent care	
MD now	
Orchid city emergency	
physicians	
Dr. Merrill Reuter	
Dr. Elizabeth Trinidad	
Dr. Jordan Grable (CME)	
Dr. Mark Agrama	
Dr. John Baker	
Dr. Terry Bachow	
Dr. Gloria Dunkin	
Dr. Brett Fried	

Dr. Robert Friedman	
Dr. Patricia Harding	
Dr. Ross Hauer	
Dr. Richard Hays	
Dr. Alex Hernandez	
Dr. Mashira Jackson	
Dr. Anita Jones	
Dr. David Markowitz	
Dr. Ana Mateo-Bibeau	
Dr. Ekom Nnamdie	
Dr. Olayemi Osiyemi	
Palm Beach Neurology	
Midtown Imaging	
The Imaging Centers	
Dr. Arwyn Raina	
Dr. Lisa Sanchez	
Dr. Jason Sevald	
Dr. Sharma Shekhar	
Dr. Gary Shifrin	
Dr. John Shoosmith	
Palm Beach County fire	
rescue	
Advanced orthopedics	
Anesthesia services	
Associates MD medical group	
A Visiting Reddy Nurse	
Headache and Pain Center	
Behavioral health of the palm	
beaches	
Benedictine health system	
Center for bone and joint	
surgery	
DPM medical	
Gardens urgent care	
Gateway to recovery	
Helix urgent care	
Just for women birth and Health	
Center	
National orthopedics and	
neurosurgery	
Spine and orthopedic	
specialists	
Triple O medical services	
Back Saver	

Palm Beach neurology	
Premier research Institute	
Palm Beach neurosurgery	
South Florida foot and ankle	
OB/GYN specialists	
Interventional nain services	
Backsaver	
DEPOSITION	
TRANSCRIPTS	
Tina Smith 11/16/17	
Tina Smith 2/1/18	
Michael Schwede	
Benjamin Colon	
Alicea Elizer	
Frances Jones	
Javorous Thompson	
Myrtle Holligan	
Dr. Merril Reuter	
EXPERTS	
Dr. Jeffrey Penner	
PLEADINGS/DISCOVERY	
Interrogatories answered by	
Plaintiff	
Update Interrogatories	
Answered by Plaintiff	
Interrogatories answered by	
Defendant	
Update Interrogatories	
answered by Defendant	
Amended Complaint	

HOW INJURY OCCURED	
VIDEO OF FALL	
ANY SURVEILLANCE OF	
TINA	

98. Can a fall cause (GO THROUGH ALL OF TINA'S COMPLAINTS)

a. Go through which are neurological

TINA'S		
COMPLAINTS/DIAGNOSES		
Lower back pain		
Neck pain		
Headaches		
dizziness		
Upper back pain		
Middle back pain		
Radiating pain into the shoulder		
Numbness into the leg and toes		
Numbness in the hands		
Hip pain		
Knee pain		
Broken fingers		
Problems sleeping		
Bulging disc		
Protruding discs		
Annular tear		
Chronic pain		
Accelerates degenerative		
condition		
Cause an asymptomatic		
condition to become		
symptomatic		
Cause bone spurring over time		
Cause facet hypertrophy over		
Decreased left L4 patellar reflex	IS THIS A NEUROLGICAL	
- +1/2	ISSUE?	
	CAN IT DE CALISED DY	
	TD ALIMA?	
Decreased muscle strength –	IS THIS A NEUROI GICAL	
Decreased Left L4 anterior	ISSUE?	
tibilais muscle strength 3/5		
	CAN IT BE CAUSED BY	
	TRAUMA?	

i. NEUROLOGICAL – diminished muscle strength on left L4 anterior tibialis 3/5

- ii. NEUROLOGICAL diminished deep tendon reflex at L4 patellar +1/2
- b. Dr. Maldonado $\frac{9}{6}{13}$
 - i. Decreased ROM in lower back with pain
 - ii. Decreased ROM in neck with pain
 - iii. Diminished strength in the lower leg 4/5 Quad; 4/5 Dorsi Flexion;
- 99. You are aware, Tina complained of (GO THROUGH ALL OF TINA'S COMPLAINTS) as a result of the fall

MRI STUDIES

100. GO THROUGH EACH FINDING ON MRI AND ASK:

Page in PDF Med Chron Page 12 starts The Imaging Centers	<u>Study</u>		Treating Radiologist	<u>Dr. Penner</u>		<u>Dr. Grabel</u>	
Imaging	8/27/13 – MRI Lumbar	Sarner 1. 2. 3.	: L5-S1, central disc herniation abutting the ventral thecal sac. Bilateral facet joint fluid may represent inflammation or irritation , L4-L5, posterior disc herniation and annular tear mildly inverting the ventral thecal sac. Posterior ligamentous hypertrophy . Bilateral facet joint fluid may represent inflammation or irritation. There is foraminal narrowing. L3-L4, posterolateral disc bulges with mild bi-foraminal narrowing. Facet joint fluid may represent inflammation or		2.	L5-S1 – Desiccation or small protrusion or bulge at L5-S1 barely indenting the thecal sac L4-5 Desiccation at L4-5 with annular tear and bulge at L4-5;	

a. Those conditions are subject to aggravations as a result of a fall

		 irritation. Mild facet ligamentous hypertrophy. 4. L1-L2 and L2-L3, facet joint fluid may represent inflammation or irritation. 		3. L3-S1 - Facet hypertrophy at L3-S1	
796	9/18/13 – MRI Left Knee	Partial-thickness tears of the lateral patellar facet cartilage deep infrapatellar bursitis thickened ACL which may relate to ligament sprain or partial tear grade one signal posterior horn of medial meniscus	Dr. Penner read this as an MRI of the right knee. He claims there are no problems at all in the right knee. It is "atraumatic MRI right knee"		
	4/09/14 MRI Cervical Spine	 Dr. Young 1. Findings consistent with spasm. 2. C2-3. No HNP or stenosis. 3. C3-4. Disc bulge with posterior annular tear. 4. C4-5. Posterior disc herniation. 5. C5-6. Disc bulge. 6. C6-7. Disc bulge. 7. C7-T1. No HNP or stenosis. 		Minimal bulging or protrusions at C3-4, C4-5, C5-6, and C6-7 without stenosis or neural compression. Does not mention annular tear	
	7/6/15 MRI Lumbar	 Sarner: No significant interval change since 8/27/2013 when taking into account differences in positioning, technique and equipment. L5-S1 posterior disc herniation impinging upon the ventral thecal sac and S1 nerve roots asymmetric to the left. This is not significantly changed. L4-5 posterior disc herniation and annular tear impinging upon the 		L4-5 Desiccation with annular tear and bulge that barely indents the thecal sac. L5-S1 bulger or mild protrusion without stenosis.	

		 thecal sac and L5 nerve roots with disc material extending interiorly, posterior to the superior endplate of L5. Biforaminal disc bulge. Facet hypertrophy. Mild central canal narrowing, not significantly changed. 4. L3-4 posterolateral disc bulge. Mild facet hypertrophy, right greater than left. 5. L3-4, L2-3, L1-2 facet joint fluid may represent inflammation, irritation or synovitis. 6. Bilobed 2.1cm cystic lesion right kidney, not identified on previous MRI exam for which an ultrasound of the right kidney is recommended as follow-up. 			
801	12/17/15 – MRI Right Knee	Edema and contusion underlie the tibal spine; ACL laxity and increased signal suggesting ligament sprain Focal free margin tear of the posterior horn of the medial meniscus Displaced meniscal fragment MCL – Edema consistent with Sprain Displaced meniscal fragment from the posterior horn of the medial meniscus	No changes since prior MRI of September 18, 2013. Except there is no MRI of the right knee September 18, 2013's		
	1/9/16 X-Ray Cervical			Bone Spurring C3-4, C4-5, AND c5-6.	

1/9/16 MRI Lumbar	 Sarner: No significant interval change since 7/6/15 1. L5-S1 posterior disc herniation, asymmetric to left, impinging upon the thecal sac and S1 nerve roots, left greater than right. 2. L4-5 posterior broad-based disc bulge and annular tear partially effacing the thecal sac. Superimposed right posterolateral and right foraminal disc protrusion and right foraminal 		No change since prior study??? L4-5 Annualr tear and bulging disc without stenosis. Facet hypertrophy at L3-S1.	
	narrowing. Right lateral recess stenosis. Left foraminal disc bulge			
1/9/16 MRI Cervical	 Sarner: Straightening of the normal cervical lordosis, not significantly changed. C2-3 posterior disc bulge new since prior exam 4/09/2014. C3-4 posterior disc protrusion impinging upon the ventral thecal sac, new since 4/09/2014. C4-5 posterior midline disc protrusion is not significantly changed since 4/09/2014. C5-6 posterior disc bulge is not significantly changed. 		No change since prior study??? Straightening of cervical lordosis. Minimal bulging or protrusion at C3-C7.	
1/19/16 - MRI of the right knee	I cannot find this MRI in our medical records	Unchanged with prior MRI of the right knee		
1/31/17 – X-Ray of			Some Spurring and endplate	

	lumbar			changes at L4-5	
806	3/7/17 - MRI of the left knee	Comparison study to the September 18, 2013 study grade 2 chondromalacia in the lateral patellar facet with multiple partial-thickness tears of the lateral patellar facet cartilage Baker's cyst appears slightly increased since prior study deep infrapatellar bursitis similar with prior study thickened ACL with laxity suggesting ACL sprain	Normal MRI of the left knee		
808	3/7/17 - MRI of the right knee	Joint effusion appears slightly increased when compared to the prior study mild increased signal in the patellar cartilage increased in the size of the Baker's cyst when compared to the prior study evidence of contusion/stress reaction involving the medial femoral condyle 3 mm osteochondral defect identified within the medial femoral condyle mild degree of prepatellar edema tear of the inferior surface of the posterior horn of the medial meniscus	Atraumatic right knee MRI when compared to previous MRIs taken December 17, 2015		

 2/27/18	Dr Voung:	Minimal hulging	
2/2//10	 C2-3, disc bulge similar to prior study. C3-4, disc bulge similar to prior study. C4-5, there is a posterior midline disc herniation similar to prior study. C5-6, there is a posterior midline disc herniation on axial image #12. This appears present on prior image #13 at the site of prior annular tear/fissure. C6-7, disc bulge similar to prior study. C7-T1, no HNP or stenosis. No abnormal enhancement seen on the sagittal or axial views to suggest infection or tumor. 	C3-C7.	
2/27/18	 Dr. Young: 1. T12-L1, no HNP or stenosis. 2. L1-2, no HNP or stenosis. 3. L2-3, no HNP or stenosis. 4. L3-4, posterolateral bulge with facet spurring, similar to prior study. 5. L4-5, posterolateral herniation with annular tear/fissure eccentric to the right, similar to prior study. 	Minimal bulge or protrusion at L5-S1 with stenosis and without neural compression; L4-5 early desiccation and annular tear and disc bulge "barely seen indenting the thecal sac". L3-4 bulge. Facet hypertrophy at L3-S1.	

	 6. L5-S1, posterior disc herniation eccentric to left impinging on the anterior thecal sac and S1 nerve roots, similar to prior study. 7. Cystic lesion in the right kidney. I could not exclude some degree of enhancement postcontrast, although there is some motion degradation. A followup ultrasound is therefore suggested. 		
10/7/19	 Dr. Sarner: 1. C2-3, posterior bulge impinging upon the thecal sac, similar to the prior exam. 2. C3-4, posterior midline disc herniation partially effacing the thecal sac, new since prior examination. 3. C4-5, posterior midline disc herniation approximating the ventral cervical spinal cord, mild ventral cord flattening. This has progressed significantly since the prior exam. 4. C5-6, posterior disc herniation with mild ventral cord flattening, increased since prior exam. 5. C6-7, posterior disc bulge, increased since prior exam with greater postarior wall converted source of the prior exam with greater postarior wall converted source of the prior exam with greater postarior wall converted source of the prior exam with greater postarior wall converted source of the prior exam with greater postarior wall converted source of the prior exam with greater postarior wall converted source of the prior exam with greater postarior wall converted source of the prior exam with greater postarior wall converted source of the prior exam with greater postarior wall converted source of the prior exam with greater postarior wall converted source of the prior exam with greater postarior wall converted source prior exam source prior ex		

6. C7-T1, posterior annular bulge, new since prior		
exam.		

- 101. Your position as the Defense doctor is that none of the findings on the MRIs were caused by the fall
- 102. You've been given lots of records, thousands of pages, are you aware of
 - a. any medical treatment to Tina's neck before the fall?
 - b. Any treatment to her lower back before the fall?
- 103. Before the fall, did Tina ever have any complaints of pain in her neck?
- 104. Before the fall, did Tina ever have any complaints of pain in her lower back?
- 105. Before the fall, did Tina ever see a doctor for complaints of pain in her neck?
- 106. Before the fall, did Tina ever see a doctor for complaints of pain in her lower back?107. Before the fall, did Tina ever have an MRI of her neck?
- 108. Before the fall, did Tina ever have an MRI of her lower back?
- 109. Before the fall, did Tina ever have any injections to her neck?
- 110. Before the fall, did Tina ever have any injections to lower back?
- 111. Before the Fall, was Tina ever recommended to have surgery to her lower back?
- 112. Before the Fall, was Tina ever recommended to have surgery to her neck?

VIDEO OF FALL

- 113. What is your understanding of how Tina was hurt?
- 114. You've seen the video of Tina falling in the Walmart store, right?a. WATCH VIDEO OF TINA FALLING

ULTIMATE OPINION

- 115. In all the cases in your list of trial and deposition testimony where you testified as a CME doctor, did you ever testify, in even one case, that the Plaintiff's injuries were, in fact, caused by the accident they were in?
- 116. The majority of cases you do a CME, you find that there is not an injury, correct?
- 117. Do you have an independent recollection of performing the CME on Tina?
- 118. You conducted your CME physical exam about than 6 years and 3 months after Tina fell, right?

November 13, 2019

- 119. She had already gone to over 320 medical appointments related to the fall
 - a. Had <u>3</u> admissions to the Emergency Room
 - b. Had over 90 orthopedic appointments
 - c. Had over 75 appointments for depression due to her pain
 - d. Had over 120 chiropractic appointments
 - e. Had <u>**11**</u>MRIs
 - f. Had **5** Cervical Epidural Injections
 - g. Had **9** lumbar Epidural Injections
 - h. Had <u>4</u> knee injections
 - i. Had 2 Surgeries to her lower back surgery
 - j. Had 2 Medical branch nerve blocks
 - k. Had <u>2</u> knee surgeries
- 120. Its your opinion that Tina, at most, had a sprain/strain because of the fall?
- 121. And that at most, she needed a couple of months of chiropractic treatment?
- 122. Now that you've seen her fall, does that affect your opinion in any way?
- 123. The Defense firms that hire you each year pay you a lot of money, don't they?

P.26, Lines 13-15 (Valente's deposition)

- 124. In fact, you've been paid \$100,67.76 by Walmart's Defense law firm CMEs over the last three years
- 125. You've even been paid by another Defense entity over \$1M for all of the CMEs you did from 2011-2013

CME EXAMINATION

126. Did Tina answer all of your questions?

- 127. What tests did you perform during the physical examination?
 - a. Findings?
- 128. You wouldn't expect to find spasm almost 8 years after an injury, right?
- 129. Tenderness is a subjective response to an objective maneuver by a physician, correct?
- 130. She had a lot of guarding because of pain, what do you mean?
- 131. Left-sided neck pain with flexion, extension, lateral turning and head tilt.
- 132. Complained of pain in her neck, mid back, and lower back.
- 133. Could not feel the pinwheel during your neurological exam
 - a. Describe the test
 - b. Why done
 - c. Why important
- 134. Switched to Safety Pin
 - i. Describe the test
 - ii. Why done
 - iii. Why important

OPINIONS – GO THROUGH MEDICAL TREATMENT

- 135. Do you agree that Tina suffered any type of injury when she fell?
 - a. Sprain/Strain
- 136. Do you know when that Sprain/Strain went away?
- 137. A Sprain/Strain could last days, to weeks, to even months
- 138. You agree that a condition can become a "chronic" condition is it lasts 3 months;
 - a. 6 months?
- 139. A herniated disc can cause chronic pain
- 140. Can you say with certainty that Tina did not experience pain when she fell?

- 141. You know Tina still complains of pain because of the fall, right?
- 142. Its been almost 8 years and she is still in pain, can you state within a reasonable degree of medical certainty when she will not have pain anymore?
- 143. Go through the Med Chron and point out the Neck Complaints
- 144. Go through the Med Chron and point out the Low Back Complaints
 - a. Dr. Thompson 8/16/13 visit:
 - i. Decreased ROM in lower back and knee
 - ii. Spasm and tenderness to palpation of lumbar spine
 - iii. Midline and joint line tenderness
 - iv. Positive Kemp's test bilaterally
 - v. Positive SLR testing bilaterally
 - vi. Valgus and Varus Stress test positing for pain in left knee; negative for right knee
 - vii. NEUROLOGICAL diminished muscle strength on left L4 anterior tibialis 3/5
 - viii. NEUROLOGICAL diminished deep tendon reflex at L4 patellar +1/2
 - b. Dr. Maldonado $\frac{9}{6}{13}$
 - i. Decreased ROM in lower back with pain
 - ii. Decreased ROM in neck with pain
 - iii. Diminished strength in the lower leg 4/5 Quad; 4/5 Dorsi Flexion;

AGGRAVATION OF PREEXISTING CONDITION

- 145. You believe Tina's conditions in her neck and back are degenerative, right?
 - a. They pre-existed the fall?
- 146. Tina's pre-existing condition made her more susceptible to injury
- 147. Do you agree that her fall could have aggravated those preexisting conditions?
 - 1. Even if just temporarily?
- 148.

OPINIONS – REASONABLE TO HAVE INITIAL TREATMENT

- 149. It was reasonable for her Tina to go to West Palm Hospital right after the fall, right?
 - a. You would agree that the evaluation and treatment she received at the Emergency room was medical necessary and causally related to the fall
- 150. It was reasonable for her to be treated by the doctors at the emergency room, right?

- b. That treatment at the hospital was medically necessary and causally related to the fall
- 151. It was reasonable for her to have the diagnostic studies at the hospital, right?
 - c. Those studies were medically necessary and causally related to the fall
- 152. It was reasonable for her to be treated by a chiropractor after the fall, at least for up to a couple months, right?
- 153. It was reasonable for her to have the initial MRI to her lower back?
- 154. It was reasonable for her to see an orthopedic doctor after the MRI of her lower back
- 155. Was it reasonable for her to have lower back surgery with Dr. Reuter?
 - a. Why or why not? Go Develop this.
 - b. Did she need it because of the fall?
 - i. If not, why did she need it?
- 156. Was it reasonable for her to undergo neck surgery with Dr. Trinidad?
- 157. Was it reasonable for her to undergo endoscopic lumbar discectomy with Dr. Trinidad?
- 158. Should the doctor's have performed any of these surgeries on Tina? Whether related to the fall or not?

INVOICES/PAYMENTS

- 159. Invoices:
 - d. Invoice 8/16/19 \$1,950.00 (\$1,000.00 per hour)
 - e. Invoice 11/12/19 \$500.00 FOR TELEPHONE CONFERENCE at 5:00 PM
 - f. Invoice 11/13/19 \$1,750.00 For Additional Review of Records and Diagnostics
 - g. 12/28/20 \$500.00 FOR TELEPHONE CONFERENCE at 2:00 PM
 - h. Plus Depo Prep and any other charges?
- 160. You've been paid a total of \$3,700.00 for the CME and review of all records
- 161. You've been paid a total of \$1,000.00 for telephone conferences with Defense Counsel
- 162. You've been paid \$4,700.00 to give your opinion to the Defense already and you have are still owed ______

How long did the CME take? 163.

- b. Question sessionc. Physical Examination